

COASTAL CONSERVANCY

Staff Recommendation
September 20, 2007

HISTORIC SHIP *SAN SALVADOR* RECONSTRUCTION

File No. 07-076
Project Manager: Prentiss F. Williams

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Authorization to disburse up to two million dollars (\$2,000,000) to the Maritime Museum Association of San Diego to construct a replica of the historic ship *San Salvador* for use as a waterfront attraction, historical museum, and sailing classroom.

LOCATION: City of San Diego, San Diego County (Exhibit 1)

PROGRAM CATEGORY: Urban Waterfront Restoration

EXHIBITS

- Exhibit 1: [Project Location and Site Map](#)
 - Exhibit 2: [Map & Photos of north waterfront area](#)
 - Exhibit 3: [Renderings of the *San Salvador*](#)
 - Exhibit 4: [Map & photos of Cabrillo Monument](#)
 - Exhibit 5: [Letters of Support](#)
 - Exhibit 6: [Secretary of the Interior's "Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties"](#)
-

RESOLUTION AND FINDINGS:

Staff recommends that the State Coastal Conservancy adopt the following resolution pursuant to Sections 31300 - 31316 of the Public Resources Code:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes disbursement of an amount not to exceed two million dollars (\$2,000,000) to the Maritime Museum Association of San Diego (the Association) to construct a replica of the historic tall ship *San Salvador*.

1. Prior to the disbursement of any Conservancy funds, the Association shall submit for review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy (Executive Officer) a budget, schedule, final designs and plans, and the names of any contractors and subcontractors to be

engaged; and a signing plan for the finished project acknowledging the Coastal Conservancy funding.

2. The Association shall repay to the Conservancy \$750,000 of the grant amount, together with interest accruing on the outstanding balance at five and one quarter percent (5¼ %) per year, beginning on the date of disbursement of the funds to the grantee. The full amount, including interest, shall be repaid no later than two years following completion of the project, or by December 31, 2013, whichever is earlier.
3. The Association shall acknowledge the Coastal Conservancy funding on educational materials, advertisements, and publications, associated with the *San Salvador* in a manner that shall be approved in advance by the Executive Officer of the Conservancy.”

Staff further recommends that the Conservancy adopt the following findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed project is consistent with Public Resources Code Sections 31300 et seq. regarding urban waterfront restoration projects.
2. The proposed project is consistent with the Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines adopted by the Conservancy on January 24, 2001.
3. The Association is a private nonprofit organization existing under Section 501(c)(3) of the U.S. Internal Revenue Code, and whose purposes are consistent with Division 21 of the California Public Resources Code.”

PROJECT SUMMARY:

The proposed authorization would provide the Maritime Museum Association of San Diego (the Association) with a portion of the funding necessary to construct a replica of the *San Salvador*, the flagship for the expedition of Juan Cabrillo in 1542 from New Spain (Mexico) to California. The *San Salvador* was the first European ship to explore and survey the California coastline, resulting in the first depiction of California on a western map. The *San Salvador* is emblematic of part of the cultural history of California and of the beginning of the European age of discovery.

Upon completion, the *San Salvador* would be permanently based at the San Diego Maritime Museum, located at the Port of San Diego (Exhibit 2). The Maritime Museum plays a leading role in the continuing revitalization of San Diego’s port and waterfront. The construction and exhibition of a *San Salvador* replica at the Maritime Museum will add a major cultural and educational asset to what is already one of the most important collections of historic ships in the nation.

The early voyages of exploration, particularly the Cabrillo voyage, are part of the California Public Education Curriculum Standards for fourth and fifth grade. Seven other coastal states with

similar curriculum requirements use replica historic ships from various eras which operate as floating classrooms and teach students the history of their states in a tangible and compelling way.

The Maritime Museum already operates more than 300 overnight and daytime educational programs annually, conducted on board the *Star of India* and the *Californian*, both from the late 19th century. The addition of the *San Salvador* replica would increase the Maritime Museum's capacity to operate additional programs, and in particular would create a platform to bring early California history alive for fourth and fifth graders.

The *San Salvador* would be a historically accurate replica of a 16th century sailing vessel in all outward appearances (Exhibit 3). She would be as capable of sailing thousands of miles as the original vessel in her voyages to Peru and to California. She will also be equipped with an auxiliary engine, modern restrooms and other facilities, and would be certified by the United States Coast Guard to carry passengers.

Ship replicas from the early modern era, the 16th & 17th centuries, have proven to be the most successful and sustainable type of museum ships in maritime museums nationwide. The *Mayflower* in Plymouth, Massachusetts and the Jamestown replica ships in Virginia remain some of the most popular tourist attractions in their respective locations and continue to attract thousands of visitors each year after more than 50 years in operation. It is expected that a *San Salvador* replica would prove to be a similar attraction for visitors to San Diego's waterfront.

The Cabrillo National Monument, located at the tip of the Point Loma Peninsula, just west of the city of San Diego attracts over one million visitors annually and is the region's most popular visitor destination (Exhibit 4). Once complete, references to the *San Salvador* would be integrated into interpretive materials, wayside labels, and a new exhibit, "Searching for Cabrillo" at the Cabrillo Monument. Through a cooperative arrangement with the National Park Service, the completed *San Salvador* would be staffed by Park Service rangers and interpretive guides at the Maritime Museum site. Visitors would also be able to purchase a joint ticket for both the Cabrillo Monument and the Maritime Museum.

Upon completion the *San Salvador* will reenact a portion of Juan Cabrillo's voyage of 1542. During this inaugural voyage, the *San Salvador* will be displayed at maritime museums and public waterfronts along the California coast. This voyage will take about 5 months, during which the Association anticipates that the *San Salvador* will be boarded by 200,000 visitors in addition to school groups.

Construction plans for the *San Salvador* replica have already been completed, funded by the Port of San Diego, and a scale model built which is currently part of the permanent exhibit "Charting the Sea" in the Maritime Museum's gallery aboard the *Berkeley*. The entire cost to construct the full-size replica ship will be \$5,000,000. The Association is actively fundraising to secure the needed funding from both private and public sources. Once the Association has secured 50% of the needed funding, it will commence construction. Construction of the *San Salvador* is expected to take 12 to 14 months. Securing a substantial grant from the Coastal Conservancy will greatly enhance the Association's fundraising efforts with other organizations.

The Maritime Museum Association of San Diego is well qualified to carry out this work. The Association maintains several major historic ships and regularly employs expert crafts people skilled in historic restoration. Previous projects include the 1914 *Pilot* (complete reconstruction),

the 1898 ferryboat *Berkeley* (hull conservation), the tall ship *Californian* (acquisition and complete rehabilitation), and the replica frigate HMS *Surprise* (acquisition and rehabilitation). The Association has owned and maintained the Maritime Museum's flagship the *Star of India* since 1927 and she has the distinction of being the world's oldest ship still in operation.

Site Description: The *San Salvador* would be permanently berthed at the San Diego Maritime Museum, along San Diego's northern waterfront. The site is very accessible and visible from downtown, as well as from most flights arriving at San Diego Airport. The museum consists of a number of historic ships and replicas, including the *Star of India*, a massive iron-hulled ship from the 1860s; the *Berkeley*; the *Californian*; the *Surprise*; and others. Each ship features galleries and exhibits relating to maritime history, California history and local culture. The addition of the *San Salvador* replica will further enhance this popular waterfront museum and be an impetus for other major physical restoration projects now being planned along the waterfront. The ship will also be shared with other coastal cities, perhaps encouraging other waterfront restoration efforts.

Project History: As part of its Urban Waterfront Restoration program, the Conservancy has provided funding for a variety of educational and interpretive facilities and programs statewide. Recent projects include funding to the Maritime Museum of San Diego to repair the tall ship *Californian*, and funding to Sail San Francisco, the Maritime Institute of Los Angeles, and the Association to conduct tall ship "festivals," or exhibitions wherein fleets of reconstructed and replica vessels sail to various ports throughout California, giving the general public the opportunity to board and explore these beautiful and historic vessels.

PROJECT FINANCING:

Coastal Conservancy	\$1,250,000
	(\$2,000,000 less \$750,000 reimbursable)
Other sources	<u>3,750,000</u>
Total Project Cost	\$5,000,000

It is anticipated that the Conservancy funds would be provided from the Conservancy's FY 2007/2008 appropriation from the "Safe Drinking Water, Water Quality And Supply, Flood Control, River And Coastal Protection Bond Act of 2006 (Proposition 84). Consistent with the purposes of this funding source, the proposed project would be funded by the Coastal Conservancy pursuant to Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, and would entail development, preservation and interpretation.

The Association would repay to the Conservancy \$750,000 of the grant amount, together with interest accruing on the outstanding balance at 5¼% per year, beginning on the date of disbursement of the funds to the grantee. The full amount, including interest, would be repaid no later than two years following completion of the project, or by December 31, 2013, whichever is earlier. The Association anticipates that addition of the *San Salvador* replica to the Maritime Museum's collection will increase the number of visitors to the museum, thus providing an increased revenue stream from which the Association can repay the Conservancy.

CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S ENABLING LEGISLATION:

This project is consistent with Chapter 7 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, regarding urban waterfront restoration, in the following respects:

In Section 31301, the Legislature found that “developing the state’s urban waterfronts into environmentally sound areas through, but not limited to, the creation of parks, open space, visitor serving facilities . . . will promote tourism, public access, and private sector development in these areas.” The San Diego Maritime Museum is an integral part of the city’s northern waterfront. The addition of the *San Salvador* replica to the museum will enhance the museum itself as a visitor destination as well as promoting tourism in and around the waterfront as a whole. Under Section 31307, the Conservancy may award grants to public agencies and nonprofit organizations for the restoration of urban waterfront areas. Under Section 31308, the Conservancy may provide up to the total cost of any urban waterfront project. As mentioned above, the Maritime Museum is a central feature of San Diego’s port. The proposed project will contribute to the restoration of this urban waterfront.

According to Section 31316, the Conservancy may undertake projects or activities which include “exhibits or events emphasizing maritime history,” and “the development of amenities and infrastructure consistent with [Chapter 7].”

The proposed project is also consistent with Section 31305, in as much as it exhibits “innovation in sensitively integrating man-made features into the natural coastal environment.” The museum, where the *San Salvador* will be a permanent exhibit, uses ships instead of buildings to display maritime history. These ships are beautiful and historic and blend well into the land and water of the San Diego waterfront.

Further, the proposed project would also be consistent with Section 31119 of Chapter 3 of Division 21, which authorizes the Conservancy to award grants to nonprofit organizations for “educational projects and programs for pupils in kindergarten to grade 12... relating to the preservation, protection, enhancement, and maintenance of coastal resources.”

CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL(S) & OBJECTIVE(S):

The proposed project supports Goal 3, Objectives A and B of the Conservancy’s 2003 Strategic Plan, by initiating a waterfront restoration project that will promote public access and tourism (Goal A) and by implementing a project that supports a commercial harbor (Goal B).

CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S PROJECT SELECTION CRITERIA & GUIDELINES:

The proposed project is consistent with the Conservancy's Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines adopted January 24, 2001, in the following respects:

Required Criteria

1. **Promotion of the Conservancy's statutory programs and purposes:** See the "Consistency with Conservancy's Enabling Legislation" section above.
2. **Consistency with purposes of the funding source:** See the "Project Financing" section above.
3. **Support of the public:** The proposed project is supported by a wide variety of civic, educational, and public organization, as well as by local and state elected officials. Copies of letters received by the Conservancy in support of the project are contained in Exhibit 5.
4. **Location:** The proposed project would be located within the coastal zone of the City of San Diego.
5. **Need:** The funding necessary to build the San Salvador replica cannot be raised from local or private sources alone. State and foundation funding are also needed. Authorization of the proposed grant by the Coastal Conservancy will provide a substantial "base" to the Association which will raise the profile and credibility of the project and greatly assist the Association's ongoing fundraising activities.
6. **Greater-than-local interest:** The San Diego Maritime Museum is a prominent feature of the San Diego waterfront, which is visited by of millions of tourists from throughout the State and around the world. The museum itself hosts tens of thousands of visitors annually, including school groups from throughout San Diego County. The addition of the *San Salvador* to the museums holdings will likely increase the number of visitors to the museum and the waterfront. The *San Salvador* will also call at ports along the California coast on its inaugural voyage and on subsequent voyages.

Additional Criteria

9. **Leverage:** The Conservancy's funds will be leveraged at a ratio of 4:1 by other funding sources.
11. **Innovation:** The San Diego Maritime Museum is a floating educational center. The *San Salvador* will be used as a sailing classroom and will help to promote waterfront restoration along the coast.
12. **Readiness:** The construction of the *San Salvador* is expected to commence as soon as the Association has secured 50% of the needed funds, which could be as early as spring of 2008. The project would take approximately one year to complete.

CONSISTENCY WITH LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM POLICIES:

The proposed project would increase the attractiveness of an existing waterfront visitor destination and is therefore consistent with Objective 1 of the City of San Diego's Downtown Area Local Coastal Program (LCP), Open Space Element:

"Develop the waterfront as Center City's principal open space, park and playground, which is both physically and visually accessible to the public."

The proposed project would also be consistent with the Bayfront Open Space Element of the open space element, which specifically states that “open space would be defined by adjacent buildings which will include museums and cultural uses.”

The overall “Special Projects” goal of the LCP for this area is to “Promote the growth and vitality of Central City as the primary business, educational, cultural and entertainment magnet of the region.” Expanding and improving the Maritime Museum is fully consistent with this goal.

COMPLIANCE WITH CEQA:

Construction and display of the *San Salvador* at the San Diego Maritime museum is categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) under the following sections of 14 Cal. Code of Regulations:

Section 15303. New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures

The proposed project consists of the construction of a structure not exceeding 10,000 square feet in an urbanized area. Consistent with this category, the proposed project will not involve the use of significant amounts of hazardous substances, and will be located in an area with necessary public services and facilities and which is not environmentally sensitive.

Section 15331. Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation

The proposed project is exempt under this section because it consists of the reconstruction of a historical resource in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings, 1995 (Exhibit 6).

Section 15332. In-Fill Development Projects

The proposed project can be characterized as in-fill development insofar as it meets the conditions set forth in this section as follows:

- The project is consistent with the policies and requirements of the City’s general plan and zoning regulations.
- The project consists of development within the city limits and will be located on a site of no more than five acres, and is substantially surrounded by urban uses.
- The project site has no value as habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species.
- Completion of the project will not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air or water quality.
- The project site is adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

Staff will file a Notice of Exemption upon the Conservancy’s authorization of the project.