

COASTAL CONSERVANCY

Staff Recommendation
December 2, 2010

SAN FRANCISCO BAY TRAIL: PIER 43 PROMENADE

Project No. 07-063-22
Project Manager: Ann Buell

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Authorization for the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) to disburse up to \$90,000 (ninety thousand dollars) of previously granted Conservancy funds to the Port of San Francisco to install trail improvements in connection with the construction of an 800-foot-long segment of the Bay Trail in Fisherman's Wharf, San Francisco.

LOCATION: Fisherman's Wharf, San Francisco

PROGRAM CATEGORY: San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy

EXHIBITS

- Exhibit 1: [Project Location and Site Map](#)
 - Exhibit 2: [Photographs and Site Plan](#)
 - Exhibit 3: [Mitigated Negative Declaration](#)
 - Exhibit 4: [Project Letters](#)
-

RESOLUTION AND FINDINGS:

Staff recommends that the State Coastal Conservancy adopt the following resolution pursuant to Sections 31160-31165 of the Public Resources Code:

"The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) to disburse up to \$90,000 (ninety thousand dollars) of previously granted Conservancy funds to the Port of San Francisco to install trail improvements in connection with the construction of an 800-foot-long segment of the Bay Trail in Fisherman's Wharf, San Francisco, subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to the disbursement of funds, ABAG shall submit for the review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy a final work program, schedule and budget, and a grant agreement between ABAG and the Port of San Francisco.
2. ABAG shall ensure installation of signs acknowledging the Conservancy and displaying the Conservancy logo in a manner approved by the Executive Officer.
3. In carrying out the project, ABAG shall ensure compliance by the Port of San Francisco with all project actions, components, and mitigation measures that are needed to reduce

or avoid significant environmental effects of the trail improvements as identified in the Mitigated Negative Declaration adopted by the City of San Francisco on October 30, 2009 pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), and accompanying the project staff recommendation as Exhibit 3.

4. The Port of San Francisco shall provide the Conservancy with funds sufficient to pay the CEQA filing fee required by California Fish and Game Code section 711.4.”

Staff further recommends that the Conservancy adopt the following findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed project is consistent with the current Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
2. The proposed authorization is consistent with the purposes and objectives of the San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy Program, Chapter 4.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, Sections 31160-31165.
3. The Conservancy has independently reviewed the Mitigated Negative Declaration for the “Port Prop A Open Space Improvements” adopted by the City of San Francisco on October 30, 2009 pursuant to CEQA and finds no substantial evidence that the project as proposed, and with the identified measures to avoid, reduce or mitigate the possible significant environmental effects, will have a significant effect on the environment.”

PROJECT SUMMARY:

Staff recommends that the Conservancy authorize the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) to disburse up to \$90,000 (ninety thousand dollars) of previously-authorized Conservancy funds to the Port of San Francisco to install trail improvements, such as lighting, street furniture, trash receptacles and railings in connection with the Port’s construction of an approximately 800-foot-long segment of the Bay Trail between Pier 39 and Taylor Street along the Embarcadero in Fisherman’s Wharf, San Francisco, known as the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade. This proposed promenade is located within the most heavily traveled segment of the Bay Trail. It will feature spectacular views of the Bay, the historic Pier 43 Ferry Arch, and Alcatraz. The alignment of Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade places the Bay Trail away from the street and at the Bay’s edge for two blocks instead of in its current location on an inland street (Exhibit 2). Construction is expected to begin in 2011 and be completed in 2012.

The construction of the promenade is the most important, visible element of a larger project. The larger project entails removal of most of the existing condemned Pier 43 ½, which was most recently used for parking and is now fenced off, and repair or reconstruction of about 400 feet of shoreline at the 110-year-old seawall. The closure of Pier 43 ½ includes the sidewalk and the adjacent curbside on-street parking. Currently, bicyclists on the Bay Trail share this busy stretch of road with vehicles. Rail tracks embedded in the asphalt present an additional hazard to bicyclists.

The Pier 43 Promenade will mark the northern end of the three-mile-long Embarcadero Promenade, a multi-use pathway for maritime functions, access to piers, recreation, and bicycle

transportation. It extends from Third Street at the AT&T Ballpark at its southern end to the entry of Pier 45 in Fisherman's Wharf at its northern end.

The proposed pedestrian promenade will be constructed over the water (Exhibit 2). The new promenade will provide approximately 36,000 square feet of public access and open space, and will be improved with new pavement, lighting, and street furniture, such as benches, railing, trash/recycling cans, and decorative features. It will be wide enough (25 feet) to accommodate both bicyclists and pedestrians. Conservancy funding will be used for trail improvements in the form of lighting, street furniture, trash receptacles, and possibly railings. These trail improvements are a critical component of the Bay Trail at this location because this segment is so heavily used by bicyclists, pedestrians, and tourists alike. The placement and design of the benches and railings, in particular, will ensure full access, circulation, and the best views possible for all trail users, including those in wheelchairs.

The Port of San Francisco has been successfully implementing its vision of greater public access and open space along the San Francisco waterfront since at least 1997, when the first version of the Waterfront Design & Access element of the Port of San Francisco's Waterfront Land Use Plan was adopted by the Port Commission. Several of these projects, described under "Project History," below, were completed with prior Conservancy grants.

Site Description: The Pier 43 Promenade is located within the busiest area of one of the top tourist attractions in all of San Francisco and is along the Bay Trail alignment. Approximately 10 million people walk or bicycle through this area every year. It is currently a blighted section of Fisherman's Wharf and, more importantly from the Bay Trail perspective, a relatively dangerous section of trail to navigate due to the lack of a sufficiently wide walkway and the necessity to ride in the street instead of on the sidewalk, when it is too crowded. The location of the proposed promenade will place bicyclists right next to the Bay and away from vehicles. Views are spectacular and the Bay Trail will be placed where it should be – as close to the Bay as possible.

The Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade is partially located within and adjacent to the Port of San Francisco Embarcadero Waterfront Historic District, which was added to the National Register of Historic Places in 2006. The Historic District is nationally significant in the areas of Government, Maritime Commerce, Transportation, Engineering and Labor for the period 1878 to 1946. The district includes historic piers, bulkhead buildings and defined ancillary structures in the northern half of the Port, from Pier 45 in Fisherman's Wharf to Pier 48, just south of China Basin Channel.

Project History: The proposed trail improvements will be made to a segment of the San Francisco Bay Trail, and thus are an appropriate use of funds granted by the Conservancy's San Francisco Bay Trail Block Grant #4 to ABAG, authorized on September 20, 2007 and augmented on December 4, 2008, for purposes of implementing the Bay Trail. The Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade is related to several other projects that were completed with Conservancy grants. In 2007, Conservancy funding from a previous block grant to ABAG made possible improvements to the Bay Trail at Fort Mason, to the north, where a narrow segment (the "squeeze") in the trail was redesigned and constructed for the safety of bicyclists. In 2001, the Conservancy authorized a total of \$600,000 to the Port of San Francisco to build the very popular spur to the Bay Trail at Pier 14 near the Ferry Building along the Embarcadero, where visitors gain a unique over-the-water experience and view of the City and the Bay Bridge.

PROJECT FINANCING:

Costs for the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade are as follows:

Coastal Conservancy	\$90,000
San Francisco G.O. Parks Bond	\$5,410,000
Port Capital Funds (ADA)	\$500,000
Security Grant (lighting)	<u>\$300,000</u>
Total Project Costs	\$6,300,000

The Conservancy’s contribution is proposed as a portion of a \$3,000,000 Conservancy augmentation authorization of December 4, 2008 for the San Francisco Bay Trail Block Grant #4. Conservancy funds are anticipated to come from the “Safe Drinking Water, Water Quality and Supply, Flood Control, River and Coastal Protection Bond Act of 2006” (Proposition 84). These funds are available for San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy Program projects that promote access to and enjoyment of coastal resources, and are thus appropriate for funding improvements to the San Francisco Bay Trail.

In February 2008, the San Francisco voters approved the Proposition A Clean and Safe Parks Measure, which provided \$185 million in City General Fund Bond funding for specified types of public park projects to be carried out by the San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department or the Port of San Francisco. The Pier 43 Promenade is one of the projects listed in that bond.

CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY’S ENABLING LEGISLATION:

The proposed project is consistent with Chapter 4.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, Sections 31160-31165 regarding San Francisco Bay Area projects.

Consistent with Section 31162(a) and (c), the Conservancy will award a grant to install trail improvements along a heavily used Bay Trail segment that will improve public access to and around the bay, help implement the San Francisco Bay Plan and complete a regional trail system (the San Francisco Bay Trail), without adversely impacting agricultural operations, environmentally sensitive areas or wildlife. Consistent with Section 31163(c), the proposed authorization will be used to fund an outdoor recreational project that is supported by an adopted regional plan (see the “Consistency with the San Francisco Bay Plan” section), serves a regional constituency, can be implemented in a timely way, provides the benefit of accommodating heavy use by multiple types of trail users as quickly as possible, and includes matching contributions from other sources of funding or assistance.

CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY’S 2007 STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL(S) & OBJECTIVE(S):

Consistent with **Goal 11, Objective E** of the Conservancy’s 2007 Strategic Plan, the proposed project helps to complete an 800-foot segment of the San Francisco Bay Trail.

Consistent with **Goal 11, Objective L**, the larger Bay Trail project will include ADA-compliant elements such as ramps, parking, and staging areas and the proposed trail improvements will be designed to accommodate those in wheelchairs.

**CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S
PROJECT SELECTION CRITERIA & GUIDELINES:**

The proposed project is consistent with the Conservancy's Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines, last updated on June 4, 2009, in the following respects:

Required Criteria

1. **Promotion of the Conservancy's statutory programs and purposes:** See the "Consistency with Conservancy's Enabling Legislation" section above.
2. **Consistency with purposes of the funding source:** See the "Project Financing" section above.
3. **Support of the public:** The "Port Prop A Open Space Improvements" bond measure received 2/3 voter approval. Support letters are attached as Exhibit 4.
4. **Location:** The proposed project is located on the Bay Trail alignment through Fisherman's Wharf, along the Bay Shoreline.
5. **Need:** The proposed project would not occur in the foreseeable future without Conservancy participation.
6. **Greater-than-local interest:** The Bay Trail is a regional, nine-county trail network that will be approximately 500 miles long when completed. This authorization will help further the completion of the trail, of which approximately 300 miles have been completed to-date.
7. **Sea level rise vulnerability:** The Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade is expected to be completed in 2012 and has a design life of 75 years. Current best guidance predictions for maximum sea level rise in the Bay Area are 16 inches by 2050 (.32 inches/year) and 55 inches by 2100 (.78 inches/year). Based on these estimates, sea level rise may reach 45 inches by the end of the project life of the Promenade.

The project area is relatively flat, with a typical elevation at or just below San Francisco City Datum (SFCD), which is 11.67 feet above Mean Lower Low Water (MLLW), but is also referred to as "0.00" for purposes of engineering calculations. The Base Flood Elevation (BFE) (the flood elevation having a 1% chance of being exceeded in a given year) at the project site is -2.14 ft SFCD. The project area will be vulnerable to flooding in approximately 2050 and to extreme tide events by 2075. By the end of the project design life in 2087, extreme high tides may result in tidal flooding lasting 1-2 hours and occurring several times per year. Table A, below, prepared by the engineering division of the Port of San Francisco in July 2010, provides further detail.

Table A: Tidal Data at the Project Site (0.67 ft SFCD typ. protection elev. at project) (-0.75 ft SFCD typ. Protection elev. at site)	Tidal Elevations (ft in SFCD)		
	Current	16" Rise	55" Rise
EHW or Highest Observed (1/27/1983 at GG)	-3.64	-2.31	0.94
MHHW, Mean Higher High Water	-5.28	-3.95	-0.70
MSL, Mean Sea Level	-8.35	-7.02	-3.77
MLLW, Mean Lower Low Water	-11.34	-10.01	-6.76
ELW or Lowest Observed (12/17/1933 at GG)	-13.14	-11.81	-8.56
BFE, Base Flood Elevation (FEMA 100yr) (1)	-2.14	-0.81	2.44

(1) BFE consists of a steady water level component and wave crest component that have been statistically combined using the specific procedures outlined in the FEMA Pacific Coast Guidelines. Adding sea level rise to this value is very conservative.

The Port reviewed several project strategies for managing potential sea level rise effects on the project, including the following:

- (a) Raise the deck by the predicted sea level rise during the project life.
- (b) Provide a solid barrier around the perimeter of the wharf.
- (c) Include provisions to raise the deck height in the future.

The final strategy chosen includes:

- (a) Design the deck structure to withstand forces from a potential sea level rise of up to 45 inches.
- (b) Provide finishes that can tolerate limited coastal flooding.
- (c) Tilt the deck up toward the Bay and provide a water edge railing with a short solid base, thus gaining 12” of additional protection along the length of the project, an elevation similar to the maximum predicted BFE at 2073 (61 years after project opening).

The Port believes this strategy provides maximum public benefit for the project by integrating with the current design of the waterfront and providing a structure that will be safe and usable for 99% of design life days, and usable immediately after any coastal flooding recedes. This project will not impede any future decisions and provides significant public benefit for 75+ years using current worst case sea level rise predictions.

Additional Criteria

- 8. **Urgency:** Bicyclists along the Bay Trail currently need to detour off of the shared pedestrian/bicyclist Embarcadero to travel on the busy roadway because of blocked-off areas at Pier 43. The lighting and street furnishings will provide a safer, more accommodating, and potentially cleaner environment than what currently exists at the site.
- 9. **Resolution of more than one issue:** Bay Trail users on bicycles will no longer need to ride on the street through this area of Fisherman’s Wharf, and all trail users on this segment of trail, including trail users in wheelchairs, will benefit from the street furnishings, railing, lighting and much improved Bay Trail alignment closer to the waterfront.
- 10. **Leverage:** See the “Project Financing” section above.
- 13. **Readiness:** The Port of San Francisco is ready to take the project out to bid in December, 2010.

14. **Realization of prior Conservancy goals:** See “Project History” and “Consistency with Conservancy’s Enabling Legislation” above.
18. **Minimization of greenhouse gas emissions:** The trail improvements will be constructed using construction methods that will avoid or minimize greenhouse gas emissions to the extent feasible and consistent with the project objectives. The Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade project will adhere to the Construction Dust Control Ordinance that is part of the San Francisco Health Code. The trail improvements are designed to serve pedestrians and cyclists and the Promenade will be accessible by public transportation. The trail improvements will not create or significantly contribute to new vehicle traffic, nor create on-going operational sources of air pollutant emissions.

CONSISTENCY WITH SAN FRANCISCO BAY PLAN:

The proposed project is consistent with the applicable policies contained in Part IV, Development of the Bay and Shoreline: Findings and Policies, of the San Francisco Bay Plan adopted by the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) in January 2006.

Public Access Policy No. 8 states:

Access to and along the waterfront should be provided by walkways, trails or other appropriate means and connect to the nearest public thoroughfare where convenient parking or public transportation may be available. Diverse and interesting public access experiences should be provided which would encourage users to remain in the designated access areas to avoid or minimize potential adverse effects on wildlife and their habitat.

Consistent with Public Access Policy No. 8, the proposed project will provide trail improvements that will enhance public use of the waterfront within Fisherman’s Wharf and will encourage users to remain in designated public access areas.

Public Access Policy No. 10 states that federal, state, regional and local jurisdictions, special districts and BCDC should cooperate to provide appropriately-sited, designed and managed public access, especially to link the entire series of shoreline parks, regional trail systems and existing public access areas to the extent feasible without additional Bay filling and without significant adverse effects on Bay natural resources. Closing gaps between existing public access areas is a high priority for funding. The proposed project is consistent with this policy because it provides appropriate and necessary trail improvements in connection with closing a gap in the Bay Trail and does so without significant adverse effects on Bay natural resources.

COMPLIANCE WITH CEQA:

In February 2008, San Francisco voters approved Proposition A, the Clean and Safe Parks Measure, which provided \$185 million in City General Fund Bond funding for specified types of public park projects, including the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade, to be carried out by the San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department or the Port of San Francisco.

In order to comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the City of San Francisco (City) prepared a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) for the “Port Prop A Open Space Improvements” project. The MND analyzes three waterfront public open space projects

included in Proposition A, of which the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade is one. The City released the Notice of Availability and Intent to Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration on October 7, 2009 pursuant to CEQA, and adopted the MND on October 30, 2009.

Although the Department of Fish and Game (DFG) made a determination that the projects analyzed in the MND have the potential for effects on fish, wildlife and habitat and that therefore the DFG CEQA filing fee must be paid, the Port of San Francisco (i.e., the project proponent) did not pay the filing fee. The project cannot proceed until this fee is paid. (See California Fish and Game Code section 711.4(c)(3)). The Port of San Francisco has agreed to provide the Conservancy with funds in the amount sufficient to cover the cost of the filing fee, which the Conservancy will pay when staff files a Notice of Determination for this project as a responsible agency.

Conservancy funding authorization is sought for the trail improvements that will be added to the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade (benches, lighting, trash receptacles, and possibly railings). The analysis in the MND did not specifically address the potential impacts of these trail improvements. Therefore, the discussion that follows addresses the potential effects of the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade (the "Project") that could involve effects of the trail improvements.

Land Use. The Project would create new and/or improved public amenities for the neighborhood in which it is located, and would implement policies and objectives of existing adopted public plans which, among other interests, promote waterfront open space and public access. The surrounding uses would be expected to continue in operation and to relate to each other as they do presently, without disruption from the Project. The Project would be consistent with the character of the area in terms of its proposed use and physical compatibility, and would not present a physical barrier to movement throughout the community. The Project as proposed will have no significant impacts associated with land use.

Aesthetics. The Project does not propose new buildings or structures that would result in loss or change of views, nor would it involve removal or impact of trees or rock outcroppings that contribute to a scenic public setting. The Project would include removal of exposed and dilapidated piles that once supported a parking lot that has been condemned and closed for public safety reasons and will include lighting to ensure adequate nighttime illumination, consistent with creating a safe environment for the public. This lighting would not result in a significant effect with regard to substantial light and glare. The Project as proposed will have no significant impacts associated with aesthetics.

Historical Resources. The Project is adjacent to and partially within the Port of San Francisco Embarcadero Waterfront Historic District, listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 2006. The proposed design of the promenade would take a simple, minimalist approach to avoid creating built features that compete or distract from the Pier 43 Arch and Pier 45, or scenic views of San Francisco Bay.

Transportation and Circulation. The transportation and circulation impacts for the proposed open space improvements are limited to the construction phase and changes to existing conditions and are not expected to generate substantial new demand. The proposed open space improvements do not include construction of new recreational structures or other attractions that would generate user traffic above existing levels.

The Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade is intended to cure blighted conditions created from the collapsed former parking deck by replacing it with an enhanced pedestrian-oriented facility to accommodate visitors already frequenting the area. Changes to site circulation with open space improvements would not impact transit stops or movements. The Project will increase sidewalk capacity, distribute existing pedestrians into the site, and help focus pedestrian movements away from the vehicular entrance to the site at the "Little Embarcadero." No changes to bicycle routes would result from the project except to the extent that the Bay Trail will be moved closer to the water. The Project will be designed to allow emergency access when necessary, as required by the Fire Department, improving the existing conditions. The Project as proposed will have no significant impacts associated with transportation and circulation.

Noise. The MND concludes that with the application of mitigation measures, the Project as proposed will have no significant impacts associated with noise. The improvements are for passive recreational enjoyment. Demolition, excavation, and construction will temporarily increase noise in the project vicinity. Construction equipment will generate noise and possibly vibrations that could be considered an annoyance by occupants of nearby properties. There are no known sensitive noise receptors surrounding the proposed open space improvements that have the potential to be adversely affected by construction noise.

Air Quality. The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) CEQA Guidelines recognize that construction equipment emits ozone precursors, but indicates that such emissions are included in the emission inventory that is the basis for regional air quality plans. Therefore, construction emissions are not expected to impede attainment or maintenance of ozone standards in the Bay Area. The proposed projects will not create or significantly contribute to new vehicle traffic, nor will they create on-going operational sources of air pollutant emissions.

According to the BAAQMD guidance for CEQA analysis, a project would have potentially significant emissions impacts if the project were to generate more than 2,000 vehicle trips per day, an effect which this Project is not expected to have. The operational emissions are minimal and would result from installation of approximately 20 new street lights and additional maintenance activities at the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade, requiring an additional six new vehicle miles traveled per week. This is well below the BAAQMD's threshold for significant air quality impacts. Therefore, consistent with BAAQMD guidance, no quantitative analysis of transportation air quality is required, and the project would not result in a significant effect with regard to operational air quality. The Project will not create any stationary emissions. The Project will not violate any BAAQMD ambient air quality standard or contribute substantially to an existing or projected air quality violation. Therefore, no significant operational air quality impacts would be generated by the Project.

Greenhouse Gas Emissions.

The proposed Project will emit greenhouse gases during the operational phase as a result of 20 new street lights and an incremental number of new vehicle trips (estimated at six new vehicle miles traveled per week) for maintenance work. These emissions are estimated at 5.6 metric tons of CO₂-equivalent. The MND states that this level is clearly insignificant. Additionally, since the MND was finalized, the BAAQMD has adopted a threshold of significance for operational related levels of greenhouse gas emissions, which is 1,100 metric tons of CO₂ equivalent

emissions per year for non-stationary sources. Thus, the operational emissions are not significant. The majority of GHG emissions resulting from the Project would occur during the construction phase. According to the BAAQMD, construction emissions represent a small portion of the Bay Area's GHG emissions (less than two percent). In terms of CO₂-equivalence, Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade construction emissions would be 1,795.96 tons, and concrete emissions would be 468 tons. Given that construction emissions in the Bay Area represent a minimal amount of GHG emissions and that the proposed project would contribute only an extremely small amount to these emissions, the proposed project would not contribute considerably to the cumulative effects of GHG emissions such that it would impair the state's ability to implement AB32, nor would the proposed project conflict with San Francisco's local actions to reduce GHG emissions.

As such, construction and operational characteristics of the Project would not result in cumulatively considerable increases in greenhouse gas emissions.

Recreation. The proposed open space improvements would increase the locations and area available to the public for passive recreational enjoyment of the San Francisco Bay waterfront within Fisherman's Wharf. The Project as proposed will have no significant impacts associated with recreation.

Utilities and Service Systems. The Project will not require substantial expansion of wastewater/stormwater treatment facilities or an extension of a sewer trunk line as the project sites are all currently served by existing facilities. Given that existing service management plans address anticipated growth in the region and the nature of the Project, which does not include residential or commercial uses, the Project will not have a significant cumulative effect on utility service provision or facilities.

Public Services. Development of the Project will improve an existing public open space area. The Project is not expected to either increase the service calls to the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) or increase crime prevention activities and additional policing of the project area. The Project will not contribute to the need for new school facilities, library services, community centers, or other public facilities. Thus, the Project as proposed will have no significant impacts associated with public services.

Hydrology and Water Quality. All of the activities performed to carry out the Project will require permits and authorizations from agencies that would ensure the protection of water quality, possibly including Army Corps of Engineers, Regional Water Quality Control Board, San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC), and in addition, an Environmental Protection Plan to help the Port communicate and plan for environmental protection activities and compliance. The proposed open space improvements would offer some water quality benefits by removing creosote-treated wood, which has been demonstrated to cause contamination of sediment in the vicinity of creosote-treated piles and toxicity to herring eggs settled on creosote-treated piles. The proposed open space improvements would not change the amount of impervious surface area nor measurably affect current runoff or groundwater. Therefore, neither groundwater resources nor runoff and drainage would be adversely affected.

Maps published in 2007 by BCDC indicate that, with potential sea level rise due to global warming, areas of San Francisco along the Bay shoreline could be inundated. There is no tsunami or mudslide hazard at the site. The proposed project would not have a significant impact on water quality standards, groundwater, drainage, or runoff, and thus, would not contribute considerably to cumulative impacts in these areas. Flood and inundation hazards are site-specific; thus, the proposed project would have no cumulatively considerable impacts. The San Francisco Public Utility Commission (SFPUC), which provides wastewater treatment in the City, has accounted for such growth in its service projections. Thus, the Project will not contribute to any cumulatively considerable impacts on hydrology or water quality.

The Port issued a Mitigation Measure Monitoring Program (“MMMP”) on October 18, 2010 to ensure that the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade is constructed and operated in conformance with all mitigation measures identified in the MND.

Based on the foregoing, Conservancy staff concludes that the Pier 43 Bay Trail Promenade project as proposed and mitigated, and as additionally tracked as required in the MMRP, poses no potential for significant environmental effects. Accordingly, the portion of the Promenade to be funded with Conservancy granted funds (the trail improvements) will not have a significant effect on the environment. Therefore, staff recommends that the Conservancy concur with the MND prepared and adopted by the City of San Francisco and attached as Exhibit 3, and that the Conservancy find that there is no substantial evidence that the trail improvements, as mitigated, may have a significant effect on the environment. Staff will file a Notice of Determination upon the Conservancy’s approval of the project.