



**San Francisco Bay Area Water Trail  
Implementation Meeting #21  
March 10, 2017**

**Meeting Summary –Draft**

**Attendees:**

<i>Project Management Team (PMT)</i>	Avra Heller, Lynn Sadler (by phone), Laura Thompson, Matthew Trujillo
<i>Water Trail Staff</i>	Ben Botkin
<i>Advisory Committee (AC)</i>	Don Brubaker, Julie Bondurant, Ted Choi (by phone), Lynn Cullivan, Cecily Harris (by phone), Wendy Proctor, Penny Wells, Laura Wilson, Victoria Heyse (SFBBO, for Yiwei Wang)
<i>Stakeholder Group and Guests:</i>	Bo Barnes, Brenda Buxton (CSCC), Roberta Feliciano (City of Richmond), Todd Hallenbeck (BCDC, by phone), Anna Schneider (CSCC), Susanne von Rosenberg (GAIA)
<i>Facilitation</i>	Ariel Ambruster, Center for Collaborative Policy

**Key Outcomes**

**Project Management Team Decision-Making Process**

- Within the PMT, members will strive to reach consensus among themselves on decisions. Consensus here is not defined as one hundred percent agreement on the issue under consideration. Instead, it means that all PMT members either fully support a proposed decision, or, if efforts to reach consensus are not successful, all members can "live with" a majority proposal moving forward. "Live with" means that those with a minority viewpoint may have serious disagreement with the proposal, but do not wish to block or veto it. In these cases, minority viewpoints will be clearly documented. If the minority wishes to veto or block the decision, the decision will not pass. A 50-50 split is

1515 Clay Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Oakland, California 94612-2530  
510•286•1015 Fax 510•286•0470

an automatic no; however, additional deliberations may be scheduled at a subsequent meeting at the request of the PMT. Final language will be added and brought for PMT approval at the June 2017 meeting.

### **Water Trail (Water Trail) Trailhead Designations**

- Richmond Marina (Richmond, Contra Costa County) - Advisory Committee consensus guidance in support of designation; conditionally designated by Project Management Team (PMT).
- Barbara and Jay Vincent Park (Richmond, Contra Costa County) - Advisory Committee consensus guidance in support of designation; conditionally designated by Project Management Team (PMT).
- Shimada Friendship Park (Richmond, Contra Costa County) - Advisory Committee consensus guidance in support of designation; conditionally designated by Project Management Team (PMT).
- Boat Street Ramp (Richmond, Contra Costa County) - Advisory Committee consensus guidance in support of designation; conditionally designated by Project Management Team (PMT).

### **Detailed Meeting Minutes**

#### **Welcome, Introductions, and Agenda Review**

The meeting started with introductions by the attendees and an overview of the agenda and ground rules.

Water Trail staff apologized to Golden Gate Audubon Society, who were inadvertently left off of the email notifications of this meeting.

#### **Updates and Announcements from Project Management Team, Water Trail Staff, and Advisory Committee Members**

##### Updates

Updates on Water Trail staff activities are summarized in the [staff update presentation](#). Per survey responses from the PMT, Advisory Committee and public, three of the four Water Trail meetings this year will be held at the State Building in the Oakland, and one will be in San Francisco. The September meeting will be in San Francisco.

##### Other Updates:

- Crane Cove park design is complete, site preparation is underway, and construction will be bid out with an anticipated start this summer.
- Hunter's Point Naval Shipyard redevelopment is in the early stages and the Candlestick Point planning process is starting. Both locations are a number of years off from breaking ground, but may present opportunities for Water Trail sites. Water trail staff are tracking these sites.

- Lynn Sadler, Ben Botkin, and Kevin Takei will attend and present at upcoming Greenways (Trail) conference in April.
- Lynn Sadler/DBW are doing a data gap analysis for the Delta Water Trail and are figuring out ways they can work with economically depressed areas to have the Delta Water Trail be an economic driver.

### **Clarification of PMT Decision Making**

At the last PMT meeting two PMT members were in favor of conditionally designating Emeryville Point as a Water Trail site and one PMT member was opposed. It was unclear to the PMT at that time whether a majority decision was adequate for site designation. The language in the PMT charter is not very clear with regard to non-consensus decisions. The goal is to reach consensus, but there is a gradient of consensus – in other words, there is a difference between being able to live with something and feeling a need to block/veto it. The proposed charter change clarifies “being able to live with something.” Because PMT has 4 members if 2 are against a decision (e.g., site designation), by definition the decision is NO because there would not be a majority. If there is a non-consensus majority decision, the minority viewpoint will be recorded. The PMT reviewed and deliberated on the proposed [decision-making memo](#) and [proposed charter revision](#).

PMT Discussion of Proposed Change: clarify in the revisions that not moving forward means that it’s a NO decision unless PMT decides that it needs more time to deliberate. All PMT members like new language and approved the charter revisions with the proposed change and the decision-making memo. Finalized language will be brought for PMT approval at the June 2017 meeting.

### **Water Trail Regional Map Development**

Ben presented the latest version of the Water Trail map and a physical map was provided for mark-ups by attendees. There will be multiple opportunities for input along the way to finalizing the maps. Ben is looking for more images –primarily people boating (wearing proper safety gear). If you have photos to share, please email them directly to Ben (BenB@abag.ca.gov).

Maps will be distributed widely (including to school groups), and will also be available online for printing.

### Discussion and Q&A

Division of Boating and Waterways has a grantee that developed an app for finding working pump-out stations in all of San Francisco Bay and on the ocean side. Is available; DBW has asked them to add Water Trail site locations. The area of Water Trail is entirely within app’s range. The app is primarily for motorized boaters who have sewage to pump, but adding Water Trail could have them be more aware of NMSB. The app is being prepared by SFEP, who are also working with Ben on the Water Trail map, so there is good cross-fertilization.

SFPUC monitors roughly 20 areas within San Francisco that provide meteorological info and water quality/bacterial contamination – that information should be linked to the app.

When maps get developed the absolute most important safety info that can be provided is tides, currents, winds, shipping – all available on-line so include links on maps. Consider identifying webcams that are relevant and provide links.

### **Measure AA Grant Funding – Water Trail Project List**

Ben distributed a list of projects to be proposed by the Water Trail for funding under Measure AA. Water Trail staff hope to incorporate the Water Trail as key component of public access to be funded by Measure AA. March 10<sup>th</sup> with absolute deadline of March 13 AM to submit list to restoration authority, participants were asked to provide any additional suggestions to Water Trail staff.

### Discussion and Q&A

Laura Thompson is on the Measure AA Advisory Committee. It consists of 34 people and had its first meeting at the end of February. The first task is to look at grant program guidelines. The Advisory Committee is currently providing comments to CSCC and SFEP staff

The Projects list will be updated every 2 years. It's advantageous to be on the list to get funding, but not required. Water Trail staff reached out to various groups to get ideas for projects on the Water Trail list.

Would like to see maintenance as a "project" to be considered as part of Measure AA funding – it's very hard for agencies to get maintenance funding.

Comments on the draft list: USFWS Hudeman Slough contribution: USFWS is hoping to get funding to repair road - Ramal Rd to North Skaggs Island Road. Hudeman Slough boat ramp is not owned by USFWS – but USFWS owns road (50 feet from either side of center). USFWS just added a restroom at the Sears Point Dixon unit; there is also one at Cullinan. USFWS just got a new contractor to service them. Would like to have one at Skaggs Island as well.

Current information (regularly updates) of Water Trail maps are important because as restorations proceed conditions on the water change.

### **Trailhead Designation Consideration: Richmond Marina Bay Sites ([See Slides d1 through 52 in Water Trail Meeting Presentation](#))**

Water Trail staff presented an overall perspective and provided specific presentation for each site. The three sites are: the [Richmond Marina](#), [Barbara and Jay Vincent Park](#), and [Shimada Friendship Park](#). Information on each of the sites can be found on the Conservancy's Water Trail webpage, under the 3/10/17 [agenda](#), or by clicking on the link for each site, above. These are three separate sites, but really close together. The goal is to streamline discussion, so that there is more time for other matters that are also important.

### General Discussion and Q&A

- Chevron Long Wharf has a security zone around it -- this is a Homeland Security issue
- All exclusion zones should be shown on Water Trail signage and map
- These three sites are part of the Cultural Heritage Water Trail being developed by the City of Richmond (included in the Richmond General Plan)
- Red Oak Victory is very amenable to having overnight stays. At some point the stairs up to pier were damaged; if they can be restored the ship would be great overnight stay location again
- Pt. San Pablo Yacht Harbor is also historic and under new management. The new management has broad vision for upgrading harbor, possibly providing camping, and adding a restaurant or café. East Brother Island light house (has a B&B) is reached from this harbor
- The route between Richmond Marina Bay sites and San Pablo Bay Yacht Harbor goes past a dangerous point (Chevron Long Wharf) – when tankers are coming in they are quite intimidating. This route could increase in popularity as these three sites become more popular. Make the safety issue clear on Water Trail signs. There are also significant currents in that area
- There are few opportunities in this general area for rower and scullers; Water Trail staff will look into this issue to see if these two types of NMSB could be accommodated at the Marina. Water Trail staff did notice some sculls being stored at the Marina.

### *Richmond Marina Presentation*

- Great place for beginning paddlers – protected area
- Has overnight paid parking; there is kayak storage – indoor (\$40) and outdoor (\$30) – open to expanding if increased demand
- Nice interpretative signage
- Classes are provided and site is used by groups
- New ADA-accessible kayak launch to be constructed in 2018 (part of/mitigation for ferry project). Still in permitting; WETA came to Water Trail a while ago, will be back before finalizing plans. Changes were responsive to comments provided at earlier Water Trail meeting. Updated plans are due in this spring – WETA is working towards having a BCDC permit in summer and to start construction in late summer/fall (outside fish window)
- Launch ramp/high freeboard docks can get pretty busy with motorized boats, especially in the summer

### *Richmond Marina Discussion and Q&A*

- Signage would be very similar to Ferry Point (but Ferry Point had more information about seals).
- Signage should be installed now rather than waiting for new kayak dock

- It's always good to ensure that it's clear that restrooms are available; make sure that there is good signage where kayakers get out
- It's unclear if all of Brooks Island including the seawall is off limits to boaters. Can kayakers paddle through the gap in the seawall to the sandy area behind it? EBRPD believes the seawall area is off limits as well but will verify that. Water Trail signage must be clear about where kayakers can and cannot land
- The new kayak landing design should include a few cleats away from access point so that kayakers tying up temporarily don't block the dock

*Barbara and Jay Vincent Park Presentation*

- Great interpretive signage – Rosie the Riveter Historic Park has done great job with that

*Barbara and Jay Vincent Park Discussion and Q&A*

- Would be nice to have mechanism to get special permission to park overnight. Is there street parking as well (in residential area)? Roberta Feliciano will follow up – overnight parking would go through Parks and Recreation Department
- This is one of the sweetest spots in the Bay Area – well executed, lovely, hard-packed sand, bathrooms are clean, it feels safe, and is launch close to parking. Can launch inside or outside the harbor (seawall)
- The site is very well maintained.
- The city does maintenance. Marina Bay HOA has landscaping and maintenance fee, and they probably contribute - Roberta Feliciano will follow-up

*Shimada Friendship Park Presentation*

Site is located outside of marina. It is mostly used by windsurfers. It's a popular park. Access to the water is via water access stairs – given near-by accessible sites, this site is probably not good candidate for increased accessibility effort

*Shimada Friendship Park Discussion and Q&A*

- The bathroom is a great model for restrooms in other locations – the concrete sliding door protects against vandalism/illegal camping.
- This is a standard design -- Romtek makes the plans.
- Ms. Feliciano will check on restroom hours; some Water Trail Advisory Committee members commented that they had typically found the bathrooms to be closed on weekdays.

*Richmond Marina Advisory Committee Deliberations*

The following points were raised during Advisory Committee Deliberations:

- The site designation conditions should be modified to include clearly describing which parts of Brooks Island are off-limits and to clearly define the exclusion zone around the Chevron Long Wharf

- If possible, add some information to the Marina sign board to indicate that a new kayak dock is coming (Water Trail staff indicated that the Harbor Master is open to having the Water Trail add information to the sign board)
- Seal haul-out information is required at this site (it is a standard component of the Water Trail educational sign)
- The sooner Water Trail signage can go, the better, especially if the sand spit at Brooks Island is actually off-limits to boaters

The Advisory Committee unanimously recommended conditional site designation with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and the supplemental conditions listed above.

*Richmond Marina Project Management Team Deliberations*

The PMT unanimously supported site designation with the supplemental conditions proposed by the Advisory Committee. The PMT agreed with the Advisory Committee that putting up the Water Trail educational sign before the new kayak dock is put in is a good idea to help boaters boat responsibly around Brooks Island.

The Project Management Team unanimously decided in favor of conditional designation of the Richmond Marina with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and supplemental conditions recommended by the Advisory Committee.

*Barbara and Jay Vincent Park Advisory Committee Deliberations*

- This is a terrific site.
- The site designation conditions should require that the Water Trail education sign have the same language regarding Brooks Island and the Chevron Long Wharf as was discussed for the Richmond Marina.

The Advisory Committee unanimously recommended conditional site designation with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and the supplemental conditions listed above.

*Barbara and Jay Vincent Park Project Management Team Deliberations*

The PMT unanimously supported site designation with the supplemental conditions proposed by the Advisory Committee.

The Project Management Team unanimously decided in favor of conditional designation of Barbara and Jay Vincent Park with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and supplemental conditions recommended by the Advisory Committee.

*Shimada Friendship Park Advisory Committee Deliberations*

The following point was made during Advisory Committee Deliberations:

- The site designation conditions should require that the Water Trail education sign have the same language regarding Brooks Island and the Chevron Long Wharf as was discussed for the Richmond Marina.

The Advisory Committee unanimously recommended conditional site designation with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and the supplemental conditions listed above.

*Shimada Friendship Park Project Management Team Deliberations*

The following point was made during PMT Deliberations:

- The Water Trail education sign does not need the warning language regarding the Chevron Long Wharf because site users would not be going there.

The PMT unanimously supported site designation with the supplemental conditions proposed by the Advisory Committee.

The Project Management Team unanimously decided in favor of conditional designation of Shimada Park with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and supplemental conditions recommended by the Advisory Committee.

**Groundwork Richmond Kayak Program Presentation**

Background

Matt Holmes, Deputy Executive Director, presented information about Groundwork Richmond and its kayak program. Background information about Groundwork Richmond is available on their [website](#). Matt's career focus has been on outreach to underserved communities, including during his time as a ranger at the National Park Service.

The national groundwork program was established by EPA and the National Park Service with a goal of getting more community involvement in underserved communities, especially around Brownfield sites. There are currently 32 Groundwork USA chapters; the two in California are in Richmond and San Diego, and there's one in the final planning stages in Oakland. Groundwork Richmond sees itself as a city-wide forester and its goal is to conduct youth development efforts through exposing youth to nature. Rather than just taking youth out to the national parks, the goal is to help the local community change its home turf. Projects within the City of Richmond include the Richmond Greenway (a former railroad corridor that is being converted to a trail and green space), as well as extensive urban forestry efforts. Kevin Takei, an Advisory Committee member for the Water Trail, is on the board of Groundwork Richmond.



Groundwork Richmond has the support of many community partners, including the Convention and Visitors Bureau in Richmond and is working with the US Forest Service on Mare Island to establish a youth conservation corps (funding is needed).

#### Kayak Program

Groundwork Richmond has always taken advantage of the water access opportunities at the National Historic Park. They get kids out on the water, often for the first time. Many of the kids in the disadvantaged communities in Richmond have had no contact with the waterfront at all, and there is a separation between the more affluent communities along the waterfront from other parts of Richmond. As Groundwork Richmond was doing more water-based programs they realized that many of the kids that they were working with did not know how to swim and also started giving swimming lessons. Point Reyes National Seashore is a big partner in the program as well, but Groundwork Richmond has always insisted on using a local launches first. Groundwork Richmond uses multiple locations all along the Richmond waterfront and including the San Pablo Bay Yacht Harbor. The yacht harbor is very committed to developing access for youth.

#### Discussion and Q&A

Groundwork Richmond taps into kids through an afterschool success program, youth works, educational programs (including programs in the schools), and now after 10 years in the community direct connections with families. There are a couple of fundraisers coming up and everyone is invited.

#### **Boat Street Ramp Site Designation ([See Slides 53 through 65 in Water Trail Meeting Presentation](#))**

#### Background

Background information about [this site](#) (the Site Description and Environmental Review Summary) is available by clicking the link above or on the Conservancy's Water Trail webpage, under the 3/10/17 [agenda](#).

#### Discussion and Q&A

- Boat Street ramp is one of the original public access points in Richmond. Multiple funders contributed to its improvements in about 2007 to 2008
- There's not much to the site but it's extremely historic and that's enough. It predates the Richmond Marina
- Originally it was the only public access point along 23 miles of Richmond Shoreline. It was not well cared for or publicized, and eventually the boat yard adjacent to the launch moved the fence over and kind of took over the boat ramp. BASK worked with the City of Richmond to get the ramp back into public access and wrote grants for its improvements
- This is a good location because it brings access to Richmond's underserved community.

- It's about a 1 mile paddle to get out to the bay from this site
- This specific areas very protected (little to no wind) and it's at the very end of the channel finger. Therefore the big boats don't go there; it's a really good practice location

#### Advisory Committee Deliberations

The following points were raised during Advisory Committee Deliberations:

- The site has some accessible features but the launch is not very accessible
- It's a very community-oriented location so would be good to keep it in mind for accessibility improvements
- The decomposed granite is not great for accessibility, so would be good to replace part of the access to the water with asphalt
- It would also be good to work toward having restrooms there. The restrooms should be accessible
- The site is quite hidden from passersby. It would be good to have a very visible sign on Cutting Boulevard
- There are some eco-friendly polymer surfacing options that could create a great all weather surface here
- For this site and other historic launches it would be great to point people to where they can get more information about the site
- It would be great to see the side identified as a heritage or historical site
- The same sign language additions for the Richmond Marina should be made a site designation condition.

The Advisory Committee unanimously recommended conditional site designation with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and the supplemental conditions noted above.

#### Project Management Team Deliberations

The PMT unanimously supported site designation with a supplemental conditions proposed by the Advisory Committee.

The Project Management Team unanimously decided in favor of conditional designation of Boat Street Ramp with the designation conditions as proposed in the meeting materials and supplemental conditions recommended by the Advisory Committee.

#### **Other Discussions**

A question was raised about whether there has been any gap analysis to determine where we need additional Water Trail sites? There are many existing sites, and these and the sites that were planned when the Water Trail was originally conceived are the focus of the current site designation effort. The overall goal is eventually to fill in gaps not only in sites, but also in terms of facilities/services. If grants are requested for similar improvements at

sites that are very close together, Water Trail staff would evaluate the requests to see which makes the most sense -- staff would look at overall area facilities.

The Delta Water Trail has gaps. BASK very interested in the Delta Water Trail effort, and the original goal was to have a continuous Water Trail that addresses the Sacramento and San Joaquin Rivers as well. The focus on the Bay Area Water Trail is the first step in that vision.

If there is an ambitious agenda, Water Trail staff would like to be able to extend the meeting time by one hour, with a minimum one month advance notice. There was general support for this, except for meetings held in San Francisco, because of Friday afternoon traffic. Another option raised was to start earlier.

### **General Public Comment**

Keller Beach has nice hard sand beach even at low tide. It might be a good site, although there is a pretty long walk from the parking area to the launch. Keller Beach is slated for site designation consideration at the next Water Trail meeting.

### **Action Items:**

- Email photos of boaters *wearing proper safety attire* for Water Trail Map directly to Ben (all)
- Determine whether Brooks Island seawall area is off limits as well as the island itself and will notify Water Trail staff (Julie)
- Distribute copies of the site diagram used in the Richmond Marina site cluster presentation to participants on the phone (Ben)
- Provide any additional suggestions for Water Trail-related projects for the Measure AA proposed projects list to Ben (all)
- Send copy of plans for new dock at Richmond Marina to Penny (Ben)
- Alert meeting participants once plans for new dock at Richmond Marina are available (Ben)

**Adjourn** - Meeting was adjourned at 1:05 p.m.

**Next Meeting** – The next meeting is scheduled for June 9 at 10 a.m. and will be held at the State Building in Oakland