

COASTAL CONSERVANCY

Staff Recommendation
May 19, 2011

CARGO WAY BICYCLE FACILITY CONSTRUCTION

Project No. 07-063-24
Project Manager: Ann Buell

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Authorization for the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) to disburse up to \$70,000 of previously granted Conservancy funds to the Port of San Francisco to construct .75 miles of a Class I multi-use pathway along Cargo Way in the Bayview/Hunter's Point District of San Francisco.

LOCATION: Cargo Way between 3rd Street and Jennings Street in the Bayview/Hunter's Point District of San Francisco (Exhibit 1)

PROGRAM CATEGORY: San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy

EXHIBITS

- Exhibit 1: [Project Location, Photographs, and Concept Design](#)
- Exhibit 2: [San Francisco Bicycle Plan Final EIR \(provided on a separate CD or viewable at <http://www.sf-planning.org/index.aspx?page=1828>\)](#)
- Exhibit 3: [Blue Greenway Location and Concept Design](#)
- Exhibit 4: [Project Letters](#)
-

RESOLUTION AND FINDINGS:

Staff recommends that the State Coastal Conservancy adopt the following resolution pursuant to Sections 31160-31165 of the Public Resources Code:

“The State Coastal Conservancy hereby authorizes the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) to disburse up to \$70,000 (seventy thousand dollars) of previously granted Conservancy funds to the Port of San Francisco to construct .75 miles of a Class I multi-use pathway along Cargo Way in the Bayview/Hunter's Point District of San Francisco, subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to the disbursement of funds, ABAG shall submit for the review and approval of the Executive Officer of the Conservancy a final work program, schedule and budget, and a grant agreement between ABAG and the Port of San Francisco.

2. ABAG shall ensure installation of signs acknowledging the Conservancy and displaying the Conservancy logo in a manner approved by the Executive Officer.
3. In carrying out the project, ABAG shall ensure compliance by the Port of San Francisco with all project actions, components, and mitigation measures that are needed to reduce or avoid significant environmental effects of the trail improvements as identified in the San Francisco Bicycle Plan Final EIR (Environmental Impact Report) certified by the City of San Francisco on June 25, 2009 pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), and accompanying the project staff recommendation as Exhibit 2.”

Staff further recommends that the Conservancy adopt the following findings:

“Based on the accompanying staff report and attached exhibits, the State Coastal Conservancy hereby finds that:

1. The proposed project is consistent with the current Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines.
2. The proposed authorization is consistent with the purposes and objectives of Chapter 4.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, Sections 31160-31165.
3. The Conservancy has independently reviewed the Final Environmental Impact Report for the 2009 San Francisco Bicycle Plan certified by the City of San Francisco on June 25, 2009 pursuant to CEQA and finds no substantial evidence that the Cargo Way project as proposed, which is the only part of the 2009 San Francisco Bicycle Plan under consideration for funding by ABAG using funds previously granted to them by the Conservancy, and with the identified measures to avoid, reduce or mitigate the possible significant environmental effects, will have a significant effect on the environment.”

PROJECT SUMMARY:

Staff recommends that the Conservancy authorize ABAG to disburse up to \$70,000 of previously granted Conservancy funds to the Port of San Francisco to construct .75 miles of a Class I multi-use pathway along Cargo Way in the Bayview/Hunter’s Point District of San Francisco. The project is located on Cargo Way between 3rd Street and Jennings Street (Exhibit 1) and closes an important gap in both the San Francisco Bay Trail (San Francisco Bay Trail Project Gap Analysis (2005)), and the San Francisco and Regional Bicycle Route Network (2009 San Francisco Bicycle Plan). Project construction is expected to begin this spring and be completed by the fall of 2011.

Specifically, the project includes reconfiguration of the existing Cargo Way roadway to include a Class I Bicycle Pathway, which is defined by the California Department of Transportation (CalTrans) as a completely separated right of way for the exclusive use of bicycles and pedestrians with crossflow by motorists minimized. The project will move bicyclists safely out of the main stream of traffic in an industrially dominated neighborhood. The Class I bicycle facility will be a minimum of nine-feet wide and will allow bicycles to travel along a separate pathway in both directions with striping designating the two sides of the pathway (Exhibit 1). It will run the entire length of Cargo Way between 3rd Street and Jennings Street and will offer a

much-improved bicycle access route to and from the Bayview/Hunter's Point neighborhood and downtown San Francisco and Mission Bay. The improvements will include signs, lane demarcation and signal modifications to accommodate a left-turn bicycle lane, and a physical barrier, consisting of an 8" high curb with a 48" fence, that will provide protection for cyclists from the industrial freight traffic using Cargo Way. These improvements will be designed and installed in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act.

This is an important gap closure for the Bay Trail for several reasons, including its connections for urban residents to the southeastern San Francisco waterfront and open spaces, and from those neighborhoods back to employment centers downtown. At its southeast end, Cargo Way terminates at the entrance to Heron's Head Park, and at the northwest end of this Bay Trail segment lies Islais Creek, where there is a native plant garden and a potential future launch site for the San Francisco Bay Area Water Trail. The 3rd Street end of this gap in the Bay Trail is also the gateway to downtown San Francisco. The southwesterly side of Cargo Way runs alongside India Basin Industrial Park, a redevelopment area providing many jobs for the region. In sum, this Bay Trail project improves non-motorized access from the underserved neighborhood of Bayview/Hunter's Point to areas of higher employment and educational opportunities.

The Port of San Francisco has much experience upgrading the San Francisco waterfront and is currently also helping to plan and implement a major San Francisco waterfront revitalization project called the Blue Greenway – a natural partner project for both the Bay Trail and the San Francisco Bay Area Water Trail. A section of the planned Blue Greenway route runs along Cargo Way, turning toward downtown San Francisco at 3rd Street. This intersection is called the Bayview Gateway under the Blue Greenway Plan and is a major transportation hub for this area (Exhibit 3). The Class I bikeway proposed for Cargo Way will greatly enhance and be an important part of the future Blue Greenway improvements at the same location. The new facilities will be jointly managed and maintained by the San Francisco Public Works Department and the Port of San Francisco.

Site Description: Cargo Way is currently an overly wide 4-lane street that serves both light and heavy industrial tenants as well as users of the Port's Heron's Head Park, Literacy for Environmental Justice's Heron's Head EcoCenter, and San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's India Basin Shoreline Park. Bicyclists need to either ride with the vehicle traffic in the street, or make their way along a narrow, poorly maintained sidewalk where passage is sometimes blocked (Exhibit 1). Cargo Way is located in the India Basin Industrial Park Redevelopment Area. The section that is the subject of this funding request runs from 3rd Street to Jennings Street and ends at the entrance to Heron's Head Park. The street is on Port of San Francisco property and was constructed in the early 1970s to provide access to the India Basin Industrial Park and the Port's cargo terminals (Piers 90 – 96).

Project History: This project builds on a past Conservancy-funded Bay Trail project for the development of a conceptual design for Cargo Way (\$75,000). Through an eight-month series of public workshops, meetings with the Bayview Hunters Point Project Area Committee and a technical advisory committee, the "Cargo Way/Bay Trail Conceptual Design Study" was completed in May 2008. It describes multiple design alternatives for the creation of a new Bay Trail segment. The impetus for this study came from the Port of San Francisco and the San

Francisco Redevelopment Agency, who worked with the Bay Trail to explore the creation of a safe route for pedestrians and bicyclists along Cargo Way while preserving the vehicular and truck access necessary for the Port of San Francisco and other nearby industrial uses. The project also builds on the Conservancy's contribution (\$400,000) in 2003 toward construction of the Heron's Head EcoCenter by Literacy for Environmental Justice, as it will improve bicycle access to the EcoCenter at the entry to Heron's Head Park.

PROJECT FINANCING

Coastal Conservancy	\$70,0000.0
Port of San Francisco	125,000.0
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency	50,781.0
San Francisco County Transportation Authority	<u>185,000.0</u>
Total Project Costs	\$430,781.0

The Conservancy's contribution is proposed as a portion of a \$6,000,000 Conservancy grant to ABAG known as the San Francisco Bay Trail Block Grant #4, which was first authorized on September 20, 2007 and augmented on December 4, 2008. Conservancy funds for Block Grant #4 are derived from the "Safe Drinking Water, Water Quality and Supply, Flood Control, River and Coastal Protection Bond Act of 2006" (Proposition 84). These funds are available for San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy Program projects that promote access to and enjoyment of coastal resources, and are thus appropriate for funding improvements to the San Francisco Bay Trail.

In-kind contributions come from the Port of San Francisco (project management and coordination), the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the San Francisco Department of Public Works.

CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S ENABLING LEGISLATION:

The proposed project is consistent with Chapter 4.5 of Division 21 of the Public Resources Code, Sections 31160-31165 regarding San Francisco Bay Area projects.

Consistent with Section 31162(a) and (c), the Conservancy will award a grant to build a Class I bicycle (multi-use) pathway and close a gap in the Bay Trail to improve public access to and around the bay, help implement the San Francisco Bay Plan and complete a regional trail system (the San Francisco Bay Trail), without adversely impacting agricultural operations, environmentally sensitive areas or wildlife. Consistent with Section 31162(d), the project will enhance access to natural areas for urban populations for recreational and educational purposes. Consistent with Section 31163(c), the proposed authorization will be used to fund an outdoor recreational project that is supported by an adopted regional plan (2009 San Francisco Bicycle Plan, San Francisco Bay Plan, San Francisco Bay Trail Project Gap Analysis Study, among others), serves a regional constituency, can be implemented in a timely way, provides the opportunity for using matching funds that could become unavailable, and includes matching contributions from other sources of funding or assistance.

**CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S 2007
STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL(S) & OBJECTIVE(S):**

Consistent with **Goal 11, Objective E** of the Conservancy's 2007 Strategic Plan, the proposed project helps to complete a .75 mile segment of the San Francisco Bay Trail.

Consistent with **Goal 11, Objective L**, completion of this gap in the Bay Trail will include ADA-compliant elements, such as appropriate maximum slope and provision of a protective barrier between the multi-use pathway and traffic.

**CONSISTENCY WITH CONSERVANCY'S
PROJECT SELECTION CRITERIA & GUIDELINES:**

The proposed project is consistent with the Conservancy's Project Selection Criteria and Guidelines, last updated on June 4, 2009, in the following respects:

Required Criteria

1. **Promotion of the Conservancy's statutory programs and purposes:** See the "Consistency with Conservancy's Enabling Legislation" section above.
2. **Consistency with purposes of the funding source:** See the "Project Financing" section above.
3. **Support of the public:** This project is enthusiastically supported by State Senator Mark Leno, San Francisco Board of Supervisors member Sophie Maxwell, the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, and the San Francisco Neighborhood Council (Exhibit 4).
4. **Location:** The project is located in San Francisco County, which is one of the nine Bay Area counties served by the San Francisco Bay Area Conservancy Program. Cargo Way is located in the Bayview/Hunter's Point neighborhood of the City of San Francisco, south of downtown San Francisco, near San Francisco Bay, and is part of the Port of San Francisco's Blue Greenway open space system as well (Exhibits 1 and 3).
5. **Need:** The proposed project could not be constructed without Conservancy participation.
6. **Greater-than-local interest:** The Bay Trail is a regional, nine-county trail network that will be approximately 500 miles long when completed. This authorization will help further the completion of the trail, of which approximately 300 miles have been completed to-date. This particular segment will help connect underserved neighborhoods in Southeast San Francisco with downtown San Francisco, and connect urban populations with a regionally significant natural area at Heron's Head.
7. **Sea level rise vulnerability:** Cargo Way is out of the FEMA flood zone. It is also above the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission's (BCDC) current best-guidance Sea Level Rise prediction of 16" by mid-century.

Additional Criteria

8. **Leverage:** See the "Project Financing" section above.

9. **Readiness:** The Port is ready to start the project this spring and expects to complete the project by the fall of this year as well.
10. **Realization of prior Conservancy goals:** See “Project History” above.
11. **Cooperation:** Public agencies, nonprofit organizations and community groups have worked together to plan and fund a design that will work for both recreationists and industrial businesses in this area of San Francisco. Among others, cooperators include the Bayview Hunters Point Project Area Committee; Maritime Commerce Advisory Committee; Southern Waterfront Community; and the San Francisco Department of Public Works, Municipal Transportation Agency, Public Utilities Commission, and Planning Department.
12. **Minimization of greenhouse gas emissions:** The bicycling facilities improvements will be constructed using construction methods that will avoid or minimize greenhouse gas emissions to the extent feasible and consistent with the project objectives. The Cargo Way bicycle facility construction will adhere to the Construction Dust Control Ordinance that is part of the San Francisco Health Code. The trail improvements will not create or significantly contribute to new vehicle traffic, nor create on-going operational sources of air pollutant emissions.

CONSISTENCY WITH SAN FRANCISCO BAY PLAN:

The proposed project is consistent with the applicable policies contained in Part IV, Development of the Bay and Shoreline: Findings and Policies, of the San Francisco Bay Plan adopted by the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) in 1969, as amended.

Public Access Policy No. 8 states:

Access to and along the waterfront should be provided by walkways, trails or other appropriate means and connect to the nearest public thoroughfare where convenient parking or public transportation may be available. Diverse and interesting public access experiences should be provided which would encourage users to remain in the designated access areas to avoid or minimize potential adverse effects on wildlife and their habitat.

Consistent with Public Access Policy No. 8, the proposed project will provide improved access between 3rd Street, which has public transit into downtown San Francisco, and Heron’s Head Park along the shoreline.

Public Access Policy No. 10 states that federal, state, regional and local jurisdictions, special districts and BCDC should cooperate to provide appropriately-sited, designed and managed public access, especially to link the entire series of shoreline parks, regional trail systems and existing public access areas to the extent feasible without additional Bay filling and without significant adverse effects on Bay natural resources. Closing gaps between existing public access areas is a high priority for funding. The proposed project is consistent with this policy because it provides appropriate and necessary trail improvements in connection with closing a gap in the Bay Trail and does so without significant adverse effects on Bay natural resources.

COMPLIANCE WITH CEQA:

In order to comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the City of San Francisco (City) prepared an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the San Francisco Bicycle Plan project, which includes the proposed project, and certified the San Francisco Bicycle Plan Final EIR (FEIR) on June 25, 2009 pursuant to CEQA (Exhibit 2). The City filed the Notice of Determination (NOD) with the County Clerk, City and County of San Francisco (including payment of the filing fee per California Department of Fish and Game Code Section 711.4), on August 14, 2009.

The San Francisco Bicycle Plan evaluated in the FEIR is described as follows in the NOD:

The project encompasses various locations within San Francisco city limits primarily within the public right-of-way, 34 miles of bicycle lanes and 75 miles of sharrows (shared roadway bicycle markings intended to alert drivers that bicyclists share the traffic lane). The locations include some areas within the jurisdiction of the Port of San Francisco and the Recreation and Parks Department. The project area is generally bounded by: North Point street to the north; Geneva Avenue to the south; The Embarcadero to the east; and The Great Highway to the west.

To make bicycling a more viable and sustainable alternative transportation option, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) proposes a comprehensive 2009 San Francisco Bicycle Transportation Plan (Bicycle Plan), which consists of an update to prior Bicycle Plan documents; sixty near-term bicycle route network improvement projects (near-term improvements), long-term and other minor bicycle route network improvement projects; as well as amendments to the *San Francisco General Plan* and *San Francisco Planning Code* to implement goals contained in the Bicycle Plan.

The FEIR looked at program-level and project-level impacts. The program-level review analyzed the proposed *General Plan* amendments, *Planning Code* amendments, *Transportation Code* amendments, long-term improvements, and minor improvements that may be made to further the goals of the Bicycle Plan. The project-level review analyzed the Bicycle Plan and its specific near-term improvements to the bicycle network. Near-term improvements are intended to be implemented within five years of the completion of the environmental review. The proposed project was analyzed in the FEIR at the project level as a near-term improvement to the bicycle network. The proposed project is identified in the FEIR as the Cargo Way Bicycle Facility Construction Project. The FEIR identified two design options for Cargo Way and carried out its analysis on both.

Initial Study. The Initial Study assessed 18 environmental factors:

- Aesthetics
- Land Use and Land Use Planning
- Population and Housing
- Cultural and Paleontological Resources
- Transportation and Circulation
- Noise
- Air Quality
- Wind and Shadow
- Recreation

- Utilities and Service Systems
- Public Services
- Biological Resources
- Geology and Soils
- Hydrology and Water Quality
- Hazards and Hazardous Materials
- Mineral and Energy Resources
- Mandatory Findings of Significance,

The Initial Study found that the Bicycle Plan as a whole could potentially affect Cultural Resources, Transportation and Circulation, Noise, Air Quality, and Biological Resources, and that these areas needed a full analysis in the EIR. However, in the area of Cultural Resources, potential significant effects were identified for only three sites, and Cargo Way was not among them.

Transportation and Circulation. The FEIR analyzed traffic, parking, transit, pedestrian use, bicycle use, and loading; traffic code amendments; and cumulative effects. Although the proposed project will result in the removal of 160 on-street parking spaces, parking occupancy is generally low, and these spaces are not used for loading due to the ample parking and loading zones provided within the properties along Cargo Way, and because there are no designated yellow commercial freight loading spaces on Cargo Way. Accordingly, the removal of these spaces will not have a significant effect on parking. The proposed project will not affect passenger or freight loading/unloading, traffic movement or level of service. Thus, there are no significant effects on transportation and circulation from implementation of the proposed project.

Noise. The FEIR analyzed traffic-related noise and cumulative impacts from noise and found that the entire Bicycle Plan project would lead to no near-term or long-term increase in traffic-related noise, and would not have a cumulatively considerable noise impact.

Air Quality. Near-term and long-term effects on traffic and related impacts to air quality were analyzed in the FEIR, along with construction-related impacts and cumulative effects on air quality. These potential effects are reduced to less than significant levels through compliance with San Francisco's Construction Dust Control Ordinance, Ordinance 176-08 (July 2008), which applies to the proposed project.

Biological Resources. Implementation of the Bicycle Plan could have adverse effects on birds if vegetation removal or heavy construction were to occur during the nesting season. Accordingly, compliance with Mitigation Measure 3 (below) is required to mitigate potential impacts to these biological resources to a less-than-significant level.

Mitigation Measure 3 states:

To implement California Fish and Game Code Section 3503, the Project Sponsor would conduct a field survey 14 to 21 days prior to construction activities that would result in vegetation removal during the breeding season (February 1 through August 31). A qualified biologist shall determine if active nests of native birds are present in the

construction zone. In the event an active nest is discovered in areas to be disturbed, removal of the nesting substrate shall be postponed until the nest is vacated and juveniles have fledged (typically 3-4 weeks for most small passerines), as determined by the biologist, and there is no evidence of second nesting attempts, unless the California Department of Fish and Game (and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service for migratory birds) authorize otherwise. No surveys are required and no impact would occur if vegetation removal, grading or other heavy construction activities would occur between September 1 to January 31, outside the nesting season.

The proposed project does not include vegetation removal, and will likely be completed by September 1, outside of the nesting season. Nonetheless, the Port will comply with this mitigation measure if needed.

The design for the proposed project is a combination of both Option 1 and Option 2 as analyzed in the FEIR. It will have a Class 1 multi-use pathway on the south side of Cargo Way, as proposed for Option 2, but it will retain the existing central median strip and sidewalk vegetation on the north side of Cargo Way, as proposed for Option 1. However, the final curb to curb width for Cargo Way will be 66.5 feet rather than the 79 feet or 56 feet analyzed under Options 1 and 2, respectively. The only outcome of the narrowed width is that the width of the traffic lanes on the south side of Cargo Way will be reduced from existing overly wide widths to 10 and 10.5 feet, which are the normal lane widths on four-lane streets in San Francisco. This difference is minor and does not change the analysis of the environmental effects of the project.

Based on the foregoing, Conservancy staff concludes that the proposed project, as mitigated, poses no potential for significant environmental effects. Therefore, staff recommends that the Conservancy concur with the FEIR prepared and adopted by the City of San Francisco and attached as Exhibit 2, and that the Conservancy find that there is no substantial evidence that the proposed bicycle facility project for Cargo Way, as mitigated, may have a significant effect on the environment. Staff will file a Notice of Determination upon the Conservancy's approval of the project.